

# **MEETING NOTES**

Meeting Notes are not official until voted on by the Board of Education at its following Regular Meeting.

- 1. The meeting called to order at 6:30 p.m.
- 2. Members present: Mark Abate, Paul Lambert, Nadia Long, Brian Perry, and Lisa Whiting
- 3. Everyone recited the Pledge of Allegiance.
- 4. The Board of Education adopted the agenda as submitted.

Mr. Abate welcomed everyone to the meeting. He thanked the parents and community members for their passion and advocacy. We have received several email messages in just the past couple of days. Some parents are advocating all-remote, some are supporting hybrid, and some are advocating to move to all-in. Please know that we read your emails, and your comments and feelings are not falling on deaf ears. As we approach the Thanksgiving holiday, Mr. Abate also expressed how thankful he is to work with this team. This past year has been challenging, and he believes your comments and perspectives help in our discussions.

- 5. Presentations
  - a. Tolles Report

Mr. Doug Maggied, Board Member, Tolles Career & Technical Center (HCSD's representative) Mrs. Emmy Beeson, Superintendent, Tolles Career & Technical Center

Dr. Marschhausen said that he has been communicating regularly with Mrs. Beeson throughout this pandemic, including earlier today. Mrs. Beeson received an order from the Madison County Public Health (MCPH) that all schools must move to an all-remote learning model for November 30 (following Thanksgiving Break) through January 1. The MCPH will reevaluate the data on December 21 to determine whether school districts will need to continue remotely for a more extended period or be allowed to return to a hybrid model.

Mrs. Beeson also commented that MCPH had released an order for all schools to move to a blended model just one week ago. Tolles was already in a blended model and needed to make only a few adjustments. That order did not affect Tolles as much as some of their associate school districts in Madison County. However, the amount of spread in Madison County has increased by 200% - 400% in the last seven days. This rapid increase prompted MCPH to change their order from a blended learning model to a remote learning model.

Tolles has submitted some proposals to MCPH to permit them to have students on campus and keep HCSD informed as we go along. A few of our programs have hour-based requirements that will be difficult in a long-term remote setting. Mr. Cook, MCPH Health Commissioner, has been willing to work through details to get students in school as much as safely possible.

Mrs. Beeson explained the restructuring plan for the terms of their board members. We needed the restructuring plan due to some board members resigning before the end of their term and

the associate school district appointing a replacement for a full three-year term rather than completing the previous board member's remaining term. Over a long period of this practice, our board members' terms were no longer staggered. This led to the possibility of having all new members at one time. For stability and continuity, it is better to have the terms staggered to have the potential of only a few new members at any given time. Per the Ohio Revised Code, there is a provision to request a realignment through the Superintendent of Public Instruction, which is what we began last year.

Mr. Abate asked Mrs. Beeson to explain how Tolles has adapted and adjusted their programs to succeed during this challenging time (pandemic). Last spring was tough because we didn't know what would happen, but we have had time to think and adjust for this school year since then. If we have to stay in a remote setting for an extended period, it will become very difficult. We have done lots of planning with MCPH to make career technical education a priority.

Academic instruction can be provided in a few different ways, but the hands-on experience is not possible in remote learning. Typically, students would spend half the day on academics and half the day on career technical programs. So coming into this school year, we restructured how we support students. When students come to school, they spend the entire day in their lab, and they get their academics online on the days they are not in school. There was resistance to the change, but our staff and students found that they didn't have to tear down and reset the classroom for the second half of the day. Therefore, they are getting more instructional time in the full day environment. Several teachers have asked that we consider keeping this structure when we "get back to normal." We will continue working to do the best we can for our students throughout this pandemic, knowing that it is not the same as usual.

Ms. Whiting expressed her thanks for the explanation and the challenges Tolles is facing. We have several satellite programs that are located in HCSD buildings. Mrs. Beeson responded that these programs would operate in the host district's mode (all-in, hybrid, or remote). She added that all of the Tolles satellite teachers follow the district's calendar hosting the program regardless of what our teachers are doing in another district.

Ms. Whiting then asked if anyone visits the Tolles teachers in the satellite programs. Mrs. Beeson responded that their supervisor, Assistant Superintendent Jay Poroda, does go out to the satellite classrooms and checks in with the teachers. Tolles serves seventeen satellite programs in five school districts. Since the pandemic, Mr. Poroda has been taking advantage of Google Meet and Zoom to check in with teachers on a more regular basis. We will continue this practice in the future. Mr. Poroda also does all of the teacher evaluations and includes input from the associate school building principal. Ms. Whiting suggested that Mr. Poroda have the building administrator in his visits on a regular (maybe quarterly) basis. Mrs. Beeson said that this is something that can be added.

Dr. Marschhausen asked Mrs. Beeson to share the conversations that have been happening with Tolles, HCSD, and David Meadows, City of Hilliard Economic Development Director. Mrs. Beeson explained that one of the important things for their business advisory council is to be fully informed about regional needs and opportunities. Within our career/technical district, we have seven associate school districts and three regions – Madison and Union counties (similar demographics), Hilliard, and Dublin. We have been working with David Meadows to integrate

workforce development. Mr. Meadows, or another representative from the City of Hilliard, will also join our business advisory council. We are excited about this new partnership.

Dr. Marschhausen then welcomed Mr. Maggied to the conversation. Mr. Maggied served on the HCSD Board for twenty years and has served on the Tolles Board of Education for twenty-two years. Mr. Maggied shared that Tolles has seen an increase in enrollment from HCSD across all of their programs. We are seeing more students with varied interests. There are currently 269 HCSD students attending programs on the Tolles campus and 251 HCSD students being served in satellite programs.

Mrs. Beeson added that Dublin and Hilliard are always asking her, "what's next?" Always looking for the next innovation and expanding programming. While our local school districts in Madison and Union counties are very supportive of this work, their ask is often different. They ask about apprentice opportunities and what are the heavy trades available to students. We work hard to balance the needs of all seven of our associate districts.

Mr. Abate asked about how Tolles is planning to introduce new students to your programs. Last year we toured five thousand students in five days. Due to the pandemic, we will not be able to do the same thing this year. Everything has to be done through a safety lens that limits transportation and the number of students they can bring on campus. They are working with all of their associate school districts to identify and target students who would tour instead of giving this opportunity to all students. We have some videos for prospective students and parents to view and are planning some virtual meetings. We are trying to adapt, adjust, and be as flexible as possible.

Mrs. Long stated that she recently attended the "At The Core" presentation with her sixthgrader. She asked Mrs. Beeson to explain more about this process. "At The Core" is a company run by Beth Probst. She has been working with Tolles for six to eight years doing "At The Core" coffee chats. We have found them very useful because this outside company talks about all of the opportunities available to students, including College Credit Plus, college, and career and technical education. Tolles partners with "At The Core" to provide these coffee chats with our associate school districts. Because there is so much talk in our economy about is the four-year degree, everything we thought it was. Jobs are going unfilled. There are jobs where people can make good money with an associate degree. Parents are now asking a lot of questions about high school direction earlier.

Mr. Abate asked what Tolles is seeing from their business partners in terms of apprenticeships and internships. Mr. Maggied says this is ramping up. More and more companies are asking Tolles to provide specific training and partnering with us. In a traditional school year, students attend Tolles in the morning and then go to an internship/job site in the afternoon. We now also have a "2x2" program where students are in academics for two weeks and then on the job site for two weeks. The "2x2" program was created based on their business partners' recommendation, who said, we love having your students, but half a day doesn't work. This program has been very successful.

Mr. Perry thanked Mr. Maggied and Mrs. Beeson, for attending this meeting. Mr. Maggied mentioned there's often a particular perception of what a Tolles student is. There is skepticism about attending Tolles. What have we been doing to change the perception of attending Tolles,

showing that career education is as valuable as any other educational program? Mr. Maggied said that many people say, "my child is going to go to college." But think about taking your car to a dealership for repair. Think about the education the repair person has had to service your vehicle within a day and get your vehicle back on the road. We keep trying to eliminate the stigma usually associated with vocational education. Mrs. Beeson added that she hopes this is not a stigma they will face forever. The more opportunities we have to tell people about our programs, the better. Seventy percent of our graduates go on to additional training or college. Only thirty percent of our graduates go straight into the workforce or the military. It's a misconception that even I struggled through with my daughter. The experiences I saw my daughter have for real-life work, for networking, for connections, for communication skills were amazing. She wasn't studying theory. She was thrown into it and had to do it.

Ms. Whiting thanked Mr. Maggied for being a great advocate for our students at Tolles. Since the day I became a Board member, he talked to me about the importance of Tolles and what they can do for kids. Thank you for all of the work you have done and will continue to do. Hopefully, we can start getting quarterly updates on your programs beginning in 2021.

Mrs. Long asked about Tolles' five-year forecast. Mrs. Beeson said we just had the presentation of our five-year forecast. Our treasurer introduced it as the five-year forecast of "ifs and maybes." We are looking at the possibility of a new funding formula or maybe not, support for COVID-19 or perhaps not, and a continued trend in increasing enrollment or perhaps not. There are many, many questions and unknowns at this time. Even though we don't have a lot of extra money, we are in a good place.

- 6. Public Hearings:
  - a. Consistent with District Treasurer Wilson's October 8, 2020, notice under Section 3307.353 of the Ohio Revised Code, the Board of Education will now hear the issue of whether or not to reemploy STRS retiree Michael P Abraham, Director of Student Well-Being. This individual has given notice of intent to service retire under the State Teachers Retirement System of Ohio effective at the beginning of the day January 1, 2021, and has applied for reemployment in his previous position effective January 4, 2021. Any member of the audience who wishes to comment on this issue will be recognized.
  - b. Consistent with District Treasurer Wilson's October 8, 2020, notice under Section 3307.353 of the Ohio Revised Code, the Board of Education will now hear the issue of whether or not to reemploy SERS retiree Vickie S VanOrder Swank, Bus Driver. This individual has given notice of intent to service retire under the School Employees Retirement System effective at the beginning of the day January 1, 2021, and has applied for reemployment in her previous position effective April 5, 2021. Any member of the audience who wishes to comment on this issue will be recognized.

Dr. Marschhausen said that anyone who wants to comment on tonight's public hearings should email Mr. Abate, Board President, or Mr. Wilson, Board Treasurer.

### **Comments submitted to the Board**

Jon Parker-Jones, 3070 Landen Farm Rd. E, Hilliard OH 43026

Thank you for the opportunity to offer comments regarding whether or not to reemploy future STRS retiree Michael P Abraham, Director of Student Well-Being, and future SERS retiree Vickie S VanOrder Swank, Bus Driver.

Upon examination of publicly available information, it appears reemploying Mr. Abraham would save the district at least 35% in the cost of his benefits, and reemploying Ms. VanOrder Swank would result in as much as an 11.7% reduction in her salary.

As a longtime homeowner and taxpayer in the Hilliard Schools community, I appreciate measures that result in financial savings to the district while also retaining highly qualified and effective staff members. In addition to benefiting from the many years' experience both employees offer, continuity of student support would be uninterrupted since a hiring process to find equally qualified replacements would be unnecessary.

For these reasons, I encourage the Board of Education to approve the reemployment of both Mr. Abraham and Ms. VanOrder Swank.

### 7. Discussion Topics:

a. COVID-19 & CATS Update

We are operating under the Board resolution that was passed on September 28, 2020. This resolution was adopted to keep us from the yo-yo-ing back and forth between instructional modalities based on the Ohio Public Health Advisory System (OPHAS). It was designed to provide some stability before we would change from one modality to another. Last Thursday (*November 19, 2020*), Franklin County moved from Level III (red) to Level IV (purple)



on the OPHAS, which began our "watch week." A possible change in instructional modality depends on this week's OPHAS designation. If Franklin County remains in Level IV (purple), we will shift to eLearning on Monday, November 30<sup>th</sup> (scenario 1 above). If Franklin County returns to Level III (red), we will remain hybrid (scenario 2 above). This system was designed to take into account our local and state data. Since September, we have added more local data to our conversations, and we have continued to partner with Franklin County Public Health (FCPH), Columbus Public Health (CPH), and the OSU College of Public Health (OSU).

Last week was a busy week. On Wednesday, our health commissioners, the Mayor of Columbus, and the Franklin County Board of Commissioners' committee held a press conference where they issued a health advisory for the City of Columbus and Franklin County. This advisory

became effective on November 20 and runs through December 18. This advisory includes a stay-at-home recommendation and declared school as an essential service. Section 6 of the advisory states all higher education institutions and local school districts are advised to maintain their current learning modalities. The advisory also strongly advised to suspend and discontinue all extracurricular activities, including sports.

On Thursday afternoon, we received another communication from FCPH clarifying guidance to all public and private K-12 schools since Franklin County has been designated as Level 4 (purple) on the Ohio Public Advisory System. This communication states, in part, "FCPH is concerned about possible transmission of SARS-CoV-2 and more cases of COVID-19 as a result of potential spread during the Thanksgiving break. To minimize that potential, schools are encouraged to transition to remote learning after the Thanksgiving Holiday and remain in virtual learning for the duration of the advisory period."

On Friday afternoon, we received yet another communication from FCPH. This communication stated:

We know classrooms are safe with 6' social distancing, wearing masks, and other preventative measures our schools are taking. We also know that faculty, staffing, and the number of students in quarantine continue to stretch the capabilities of your schools. So to answer the question, "what is your recommendation for the learning modality beginning on November 30?"

We advise schools remain in their current learning modality for the duration of the advisory. However, Franklin County Public Health does acknowledge schools can and may make determinations to transition to remote learning based on local data and as operational needs dictate.

So as you can see, we received three different recommendations in three days. One of the things we have done as recommended by FCPH, we have reverted middle school and high school athletics and fine arts to PODS (groups of 9 or fewer students/athletes and 1 director/coach). Winter concerts and athletic scrimmages and contests are on "hold." Only winter sports are training at this time. Some people have commented that we care more about football than basketball, but this is not true. Franklin County has been designated as Level 4 (purple), the FCPH recommendation, and there is a big difference between indoor and outdoor sports. Some of our biggest challenges in the fall was with volleyball, an indoor sport.

Our CATS data shows there is limited evidence that rising community spread levels are affecting COVID-19 cases inside school buildings under the Hybrid learning mode. The data shows we see very little increase in cases inside our buildings even as the community spread has grown exponentially. In September, the CATS data showed that we were at 85 cases per 100,000 within the school district boundary. Yesterday, we were at 853 cases per 100,000 (10 times greater). The CATS team pointed out that for every increase of 100 cases per 100,000 OUTSIDE of the school buildings, we see an insignificant increase of 1 or 2 cases INSIDE the school buildings.

The increase in our community does cause concern. Due to COVID-19 (cases and quarantines due to exposure), staff absences are increasing throughout the county and our district. For the week of November 9, we had an 81.6% fill rate for substitutes. We averaged 121 teacher

absences, which left us with about 30 fail-to-fills across the district each day that week. These are courses/classes that have to be covered by licensed educators – most likely administrators. This is no one's fault. As mentioned at prior meetings, our substitute pool is much smaller this school year. The substitute fill rate for the past five days is 72.5%, 142.8 teacher absences with 37 fail-to-fills. These past several days, we have used every licensed educator (including central office administrators) as substitutes to keep our buildings open. As this infection spreads in our community, families (adults and children) are naturally getting it. Our teachers are absent due to caring for an infected or quarantined child. All of these factors put a strain on our system.

The number of our student absences in all grade levels is increasing significantly due to COVID-19 related reasons. The same is true for districts across Central Ohio. Our CATS data shows that for every one student absent due to being a confirmed COVID-19 case, there are, on average, nine students absent daily due to quarantine. The time it takes for the number of student absences due to COVID-19 or quarantine to double is 10 to 15 days. For example, if there were 50 students absent today, then in about two weeks, there will be about 100 students absent. This would put a tremendous strain on our system because we would be asking teachers to prepare three types of lessons – for students in class in hybrid, for students at home in off days of hybrid, and a growing number of students at home in quarantine. This is something that becomes unmanageable.

Our data points to what is going on in our classrooms. We are keeping students safe. What's going on in the world outside of our schools is creating significant challenges for providing our students' education.

### Hilliard City Schools Parent Survey

The survey was taken before Franklin County moving to Level 4 (purple). This survey was sent to a little over 14,000 parents, and we received 4,795 responses.

At the time of this survey, do you favor or oppose having Hilliard City Schools maintain the Hybrid Learning Mode?

Favor	Oppose	Unsure	
72% (3,438)	15% (730)	13% (627)	

If Franklin County moved to Purple on the Ohio Public Health Advisory System, do you favor or oppose staying in the Hybrid Learning Mode? **Favor Oppose Unsure** 

r2% (3,438) 15% (730) 13% (627)

If you are not currently comfortable keeping your student in Hybrid, if Franklin County is in Purple, what will eventually make you comfortable enough to do so? What are your main concerns about your students returning to All-In, five days a week, classes?



## Key Points

- 1. Students and staff are safe in Hilliard classrooms
  - a. 6' social distancing & masks works data supports this statement
  - b. The community is overwhelmingly confident in our teachers and staff
- 2. Science suggests students can spread COVID-19
- 3. Hilliard data does not indicate the differentiation of viral spread between elementary and secondary students
- 4. Partnership and dialogue with teacher's sets Hilliard apart

### Why a change after a Watch Week?

- 1. OPHAS Level 4 Purple
  - a. Hospital and ICU capacity reaching critical levels
  - b. We can only control in schools what we can control
- 2. Community spread causes significant quarantines
  - a. Stress on the educational system with a larger number of students impacted
  - Staff illness, lack of substitutes, and lack of bus drivers
    - a. While school is safe, the spread impacts adults to teach, drive and lead our students
    - b. No one is doing anything wrong; it's no one's fault. It is our reality.

### **Superintendent's Recommendations**

1. Stay the Course

3.

- a. We have never set artificial dates we follow the data
- 2. Administration and Staff Aligned
  - a. If Red Thursday, stay Hybrid on November 30<sup>th</sup>
  - b. If Purple Thursday, eLearning on November 30<sup>th</sup>
- 3. Give grace and act with empathy
  - a. Everyone is struggling with COVID fatigue
  - b. Emotions are high, and people are passionate
- 4. Focus on social-emotional needs and well-being

Mr. Perry thanked the superintendent for the detailed update. He stated he wanted to echo a few of the key points of the presentation. First, regarding the question of "why are we changing?" The reality is that due to the resolution adopted on September 28, we are not "changing." From the very beginning, that resolution stated that "purple" was the only color code that the CATS data wasn't going to be used in the same way. The reason for that is Level 4 (purple) involves hospital capacity – something we cannot control. Secondly, I echo your point about grace. That's incredibly important right now. Everyone wants the best for our students, but we may have different perspectives on what is best. It's not political. We are following the data. When parents talk about kids being safer in schools, think about what that means. They are safer right now because of 6' social distancing, wearing masks, and washing hands. In the All-In scenario, we cannot maintain 6' social distancing.

From the beginning, Mr. Lambert stated that he has been advocating that we need to be as aggressive as possible to get students back in school. I have also said that the kids are only part of the school system. Our staff and community-at-large are also part of the system. On today's briefing, Governor DeWine included information from a few chief medical officers around the state. All of the medical officers had the same message. The number of patients for COVID-19 care has been increasing rapidly. While our data shows that we are keeping students and staff safe at school, we aren't a boarding school. Staff and students go home every day, which increases their chances of becoming infected and transmitting COVID-19. I believe we are working from a solid resolution and are appropriately manage our students' safety.

Mr. Abate commented that we are doing what is best for our students in looking at all of the data. Emotions are strong. We hear you, and we get it. A few of us currently have kids in schools now. We are living this with you. There are struggles, and there is no one answer that will satisfy every parent or community member. We are using the data to balance our decisions. Parents are now struggling with their children having to quarantine for fourteen days, even if they haven't tested positive. This weighs heavily on all of us.

Ms. Whiting echoed her fellow board members in noting that we understand the impact of these decisions on our community. We have heard from many people on all perspectives of this issue. We were in remote learning when the school year began. Our students have gotten to know their teachers and classmates. I hope that knowing our children are resilient will help parents if we end up going remote again. This is very difficult for all of us, but we will make it through this pandemic. I want you to know how much we care about each of our families and each child in our district. We believe in you and believe in resilience. I hope that you give us that same faith.

Mrs. Long is impressed by the number of families who responded to the survey. Thank you so much to the families that continue to talk to us. As a mom of three, I know there is a lot on our plates. With everything you are doing, we appreciate you taking the time to communicate with us. It is beneficial as we make decisions and move forward.

- b. January 11, 2021 Board Organizational Meeting
  - i. President Pro Temp for Meeting

I just wanted to give you the date of the organizational meeting. I will provide a list of our potential meeting dates at the next meeting. I will propose to rotate the first six business

meetings of 2021 between the three middle schools. I'm hoping that by August, we can get back to our regular meeting schedule. There will also be an agenda item at the next meeting to choose a President Pro Temp for the organizational meeting.

- c. Faith, Hope, and Planning
  - i. Looking to August 2021
  - ii. Graduation Opportunities for Class of 2021

Because of the great news we have received from three companies that have developed a vaccine, I believe it is safe for us to plan for August 2021 to hope that all of our students will be able to come back to school.

We are looking at alternate graduation sites for the 2021 graduates. We are looking at outdoor venues. Several parents have asked why we don't use our football stadiums. If we used the stadiums, each student would be limited to one guest to come to graduation. One of my cautions to senior parents is that graduation may not occur on the date listed on the current calendar.

- d. Academic Recovery Plan
  - i. Closing COVID-Gaps
  - ii. 15-month planning
  - iii. Summer School in 2021

We have also started conversations about an academic recovery plan. I believe it will be a fifteen to eighteen-month plan. We are probably talking summer school, a school year, and another summer school session for some students. As we know, there will be a need for some students to get additional time with their teachers. I will have regular updates at upcoming board meetings.

e. State of the Schools Video

As I mentioned earlier this year, "State of the Schools' will not be the same. We will not be getting together at Heritage Middle School. We will release our "State of the Schools" video on December 10. There will be five or six segments to share an update of where we are and moving forward.

8. The meeting adjourned at 8:10 p.m.