



BOARD OF EDUCATION REGULAR MEETING

September 14, 2020 | Hilliard Bradley High School PAC

MEETING NOTES

Meeting Notes are not official until voted on by the Board of Education at its following Regular Meeting.

- A1 President called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.
- A2 Members present: Mark Abate, Paul Lambert, Nadia Long, Brian Perry, and Lisa Whiting
- A3 Everyone recited the Pledge of Allegiance.

Mr. Abate welcomed everyone and thanked them for their participation in our school district.

B PROGRAMS / PRESENTATIONS

- B1 Back to School Update

Mindy Mordarski, Principal at Bradley High School, stated we'd had a great start to our school year. She mentioned the barriers on lunchroom tables that are a bit of a challenge, but everyone is very grateful to be back in school. One noticeable difference is the building is so quiet even during class changes in the lunchroom.

C ROUTINES

- C1 The agenda is correct, as submitted.
- C2 The Board of Education adopted the agenda.
- C3 The Board of Education approved the August 2020 Treasurer's Reports.
- C4 The Board of Education approved the minutes from the following meetings:
 - a. August 10, 2020 – regular meeting
 - b. August 24, 2020 – work session meeting
 - c. August 10, 2020 – regular meeting notes
 - d. August 24, 2020 – work session meeting notes

D PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Board of Education of the Hilliard City School District encourages and appreciates citizen interest in meetings of the board. This place on the agenda is especially set aside to hear comments from visitors. Persons wishing to address the board should make written requests in advance of the meeting or complete the Visitor Form found where the agenda materials are located. When called, each speaker is asked to address the board at the microphone so that remarks may be clearly heard and recorded. The speaker should give his or her name and address and limit comments to three minutes.

Board members may ask questions of the speaker for information or clarification and may or may not make comments in response to a speaker's remarks. It should be noted that this section of the agenda is to

hear the views of citizens about their schools. No board member has the power or authority to act for the board; therefore, no response from an individual board member should be interpreted as an official action of the board. Portions of the board meeting are being audiotaped.

Emily Smith, 5512 Reebok Drive

My youngest son, who turned five at the end of July, has autism and is on an IEP. He attended the HCS Preschool from the age of three. When he began attending preschool, he was essentially nonverbal. By the end of his first year, with the expertise of his teachers and therapy, he started using words and was thriving. In just one school year, my son had changed so much.

In March, when we switched to eLearning, it wasn't easy. My son did not understand why he couldn't go back to school. He did not understand why his teacher was only on my iPad and not in front of him in his classroom. He was upset. He screamed, threw fits, and refused to do the work.

Just think about what it would have been like if he had been forced to continue eLearning. Think about what he and other children like him will lose. These children are not just numbers in your district. These children are the ones who will be the most affected by the continuation of distance learning. They will lose the building blocks they need to carry them throughout their lives.

I am a stay-at-home mom, and I do not need the school to babysit my children. I need the school to educate my children. I did not take child development courses in college, as the staff at the school. My son needs their expertise, as I'm sure many other students in all grade levels do. Sadly, you did not consider the staff and teachers as essential workers because I certainly do.

My hope is speaking tonight and sharing our story is that you consider all of the children and their needs. Those numbers in your district have faces and names. It is your job to make sure that they are met. So please consider our story and keep our children in your schools.

Candace DeLuca, 6610 Morganwood Sq, Hilliard, OH 43026

I want to commend the district for all of your efforts during this difficult time. She talked about several statistics from the CATS system and the CDC. The survivability of those under age 25 that contract this virus is 99.94%. Our children have a higher likelihood of dying from a lightning strike than they do from this virus. The survivability of those under age 65, which I assume is most of the staff, is %99.25%. The media and government do not discuss these statistics, but they are on the CDC website for all to see.

I understand the risks to the elderly and those with underlying health issues, and it is always sad when anyone dies from any cause. However, we are putting the health and lives of the elderly on the backs of our children, and it is not right. It is not fair for our kids, and they need to be in school five days per week. The national experts from the CDC have deemed it safe for in-person, classroom learning to resume.

The facts and statistics of COVID-19 do not warrant online learning for our students. With the current hybrid learning, our children will only learn half of the curriculum this school year. Having two to three days out of school each week with minimal busy work will put them even further behind after last spring's shutdown. All research tells us that children learn best in the classroom. We also know that the mental health benefits, social and emotional development, and the physical safety and nutritional health that in-

school learning provides are equally important.

Generally, in this country, we have the freedom to choose how we risk anything. HCSD worked hard to establish the Online Academy for any parents who deem it unsafe for in-school learning. The rest of the families who did not sign up for the Online Academy ask for the freedom to exercise our rights. The right we pay for through our tax dollars for our children to be educated in a classroom five days per week. Governor DeWine has made it clear that each school district can make its own decision. As the ultimate decision-makers for Hilliard City Schools, I implore you to stand up for the children of this district and get them back into the classrooms five days per week where they belong.

Kim Hartman, 5563 Rubble Lane, Hilliard, OH 43026

Thank you for the opportunity to speak. School is the essential business of childhood. Teachers are essential workers. In-person school is the most important act we can take to protect the health, safety, and social-emotional wellbeing of our children. K-12 is the backbone of our society. When kids are in school full-time, our community and economy will begin to recover. Keeping them out of school two to three days per week is not keeping them safe. Health care officials and pediatricians are saying it is safe. Children's Hospital officials promote sending kids back to school.

I acknowledge and appreciate that we are in hybrid mode, but what is the plan to get students back in school five days per week. Two to three days per week is not quality education. Are we dumbing down America? Will Hilliard students need to repeat a school year? Hybrid is not a sustainable solution to provide them with the educational and social-emotional support they need daily. An email from our elementary school principal said that no one expects hybrid mode to match the effectiveness of our traditional school setting. This doesn't sound like a school district that is ready for tomorrow.

Our Governor is telling us to ask you for a change. You are the only one who can get our students back into school five days per week. Please let us know what it is going to take to get them back in school. We cannot hide behind a virus. We cannot allow forced testing of college students factor into or dashboard. There is a high rate of positives who are ill but not hospitalized. This raises the question of why are we testing young, healthy people who are asymptomatic. Thus far, the data continues to support that children are not the primary spreaders of COVID. Kids are handling this virus exceedingly well. There will be a risk of infection for the rest of the time this virus is in our lives. However, it is important to consider that community activities, external to schools, are a more significant source of transmission than in-person learning. I just received my substitute teaching license and am ready and willing to fill the role of a teacher when needed. Opening our schools, fulltime is the only appropriate step you can take for our community.

Beth Murdoch, 3056 Hemlock Edge Drive

First of all, I applaud all of you for positioning Hilliard City Schools as the leader in offering both virtual and hybrid educational options. I am also proud of your efforts to maintain some consistency in our children's schedules by approving the resolution requiring a change in the county status to be in place for two weeks before responding with a switch in learning modes.

Today, I would like to encourage you to keep up the good work and continue to advocate for our children by untethering our children's access from all in-person education from the Ohio Public Health Advisory

System. According to the Ohio COVID-19 website, “the Public Health Advisory Alert System is a color-coded system designed to supplement existing statewide orders through a data-driven framework to assess the degree of the virus’ spread.” It was not developed to serve as the basis of policy, and I assert that it doesn’t even accurately measure the spread of the virus. Despite this, decisions affecting businesses, schools, sports, and day-to-day personal behavior are being made and geared toward the map and its output.

Based on the current guidelines, our children cannot be in a standard educational setting, in front of their teachers five days per week, until Franklin County is designated as a level yellow. To reach this designation, a county can have met only one of seven indicators. I assert that, given the current level of testing, this is not feasible in Franklin County.

Let’s look at why Franklin County is currently designated as Alert Level II (orange). This designation is based on three indicators, all of which are driven entirely by increased testing: Indicator 1 – new cases per capita, indicator 2 – new cases increase, and indicator 3 – non-congregate cases. All of these indicators rely on positive test results and probable cases. The system then associates these cases with active infections even though false-positive tests and hyper-sensitive diagnostic test kits have been the focus of recent studies and articles calling into question the efficacy of this broad testing strategy. Increases in testing, coupled with the reality that false results are common, will create an inaccurate assumption that COVID is actively spreading. Continuing to use the advisory system as a guidepost for education is troubling as the Ohio Public Health Advisory System is supposed to be an early warning indicator, not the basis of setting policy.

While I believe that students should be in school five days per week, I understand that you may not be ready for that step yet. However, based on your efforts to obtain Hilliard's specific CATS data, you should strongly consider a modified approach to setting Hilliard’s learning plan that does not rely on the testing skewed indicators of the Ohio Public Health Advisory System. Likely, you will never see Franklin County at a yellow level. The sooner you realize that fact and move beyond it, the better off Hilliard students will be. As it stands, we are falling behind the almost 60% of Ohio school districts that have not allowed themselves to be held hostage to an alert system skewed by county-wide testing results.

Kristen Hosni, 5084 Crockett Drive

Thank you for this opportunity to speak. Now that we’ve been in school and are starting the fourth week, I want to let you know how things are going in my household because I think other families could be having the same experience. I have three children in Hilliard City Schools – one in elementary, one in middle school, and one in high school. I would like to express my desire that we continue at a minimum in the hybrid model even if the county moves to red in the future with the full intent to get into the all-in model while in level two.

Being a mom of a child at the elementary, middle school, and high school levels give me a unique viewpoint. Regarding my high school sophomore, I have no concerns. She is doing great. At her age and level, she can work with her teachers and classmates on the hybrid plan and continue to learn.

I have some valid concerns that I would like to share regarding the middle school and elementary school at-home learning. I’ve observed on the at-home days that my eighth-grader does not have very much to do. I feel that he is only getting a part-time education. I also see his mental health being affected by the

lack of in-person instruction. I am most concerned for my first grader. This is a crucial time for young students who are just learning to read, write, and math. On the days she is not in school, she is not learning anything new. She has an excellent first-grade teacher at Hilliard Crossing. No matter what this teacher has planned for the at-home days, most elementary school students are not independent; they need parents' help. On these days, my daughter is not learning from her teacher. She is learning from me. Anything I can help her with is mostly busywork. Her school work on the screen has been around two hours, which is an ideal time, but young elementary children need direct modeling and manipulatives to thrive. I'm not trained as a teacher. I do not know the basic concepts of math and reading development. I want my child to receive the same quality education that my sophomore child has received. We are now starting the fourth week of school, and ultimately my elementary and middle school students are receiving a part-time education.

In summary, I feel that five days of in-person education is the best solution for quality education.

Barbara Ensor, 5014 Calais Drive

I am a retired elementary teacher and grandmother. I am here because I am concerned as a citizen, an educator, and grandmother about the lack of instructional rigor. I am concerned about the quality and quantity or the lack thereof, especially at the elementary level. I have a grandchild in the third grade and fifth grade at different schools, and yet they receive the same assignments each day except for one different assignment. They are to read for twenty minutes on their own and spend twenty minutes on....and usually one other assignment for a total of one hour of with no....

I have three other grandchildren in another state who receive five hours of virtual instruction per day. How does Hilliard Schools compare? Not well. I do not believe that the education provided by Hilliard Schools is meeting the needs of our students. This is not sufficient instruction for....nor does it prepare students for middle school, high school, or college. They will be woefully uneducated....

Hilliard Schools was caught off guard last spring, and that I understand....

(Note: Unable to understand what was said/voice on the recording was not clear.)

Jason Dodgion, 3880 Smiley Road, Hilliard, OH 43026

I'm not here to say whether kids should be in school. I am here to say that if we are going to be in eLearning...elementary student getting an hour of 50 minutes of education....pathetic...

(Note: Unable to understand what was said/voice on the recording was not clear.)

Melanie Wagner, 669 Platoon Drive, Galloway

Thank you for the opportunity to address these issues on our children's behalf. I have two sons currently in high school. This has been a challenging time for both of them emotionally as well as academically. I want to focus most of my concerns at this time on my son, that has an IEP. His services and accommodations include, but are not limited to speech therapy and medi-cognitive interventions.

I have yet to hear if there was any regression due to the abrupt end to the 19-20 school year. He is doing

speech via Zoom, which cannot replace in-person instruction and has yet to begin any medi-cognitive intervention, something that needs to be in-person for optimal results. My son is in high school with little time left to prepare him for his future. I cannot emphasize enough how vital these interventions are. For testing, he is allowed “read aloud” and extra time. How is this possible when he is only at school half the time. What if he has questions about his homework? Is he supposed to wait until the next day he is in school, causing him to fall behind because he can’t work on the material for the day?

I know that I am not alone in having these questions, and this should also be a concern for students without learning disabilities. He tells me almost daily that he wants to go to school every day, recognizing that he needs assistance with his assignments daily. It is also important to address the mental health of our children. I will not forget the first day of in-person school this year. Both of my sons were so happy. They had not seen most of these kids for six months and craved interaction with their peers. They admitted that it is weird seeing everyone wearing masks, but didn’t care because they got to see their friends. They both expressed how difficult it is to do assignments on their home days.

There is nothing that can replace the structure and accountability of being in the school building. I am asking you to consider reversing the criteria for five-day in-school instruction while in orange, or at worst, keeping students in hybrid regardless of the Franklin County numbers and indicators. It is my firm opinion that our children are being robbed of some of the most vital experiences needed to shape their futures. I fully understand the risk of sending my children to school in the days of covid. I feel the impact on their mental health and education far outweigh those risks.

Zach Vorst, 6181 Baumeister Drive

I have a kindergartner and second-grader at Hoffman Trails Elementary. I’ll just echo the feelings of so many other people. The education, growth, and socialization of our kids in hybrid is not a sustainable model. Their mental health is suffering. Colleges across the country have opened. There have been 29,000 positive college covid cases across the country with zero hospitalizations. We are stunting the growth of our kids, and we can’t have this. I ask again, our plan to go back to five days is for Franklin County to go to yellow correct? What is our back up plan? What if this goes on all year? This is not sustainable. There are schools all across the country, going five days per week. There have been thousands of football games played with direct contact without any outbreaks. The kids without resources are the ones who will be hurt the most. My wife stays at home and helps our kids with their work. I hope that you consider this as well.

E CONSENT AGENDA

The Board of Education approved item E1 through E2, consisting of certified and classified personnel matters. You can find the complete list of personnel matters as an attachment to the *Minutes*.

Dr. Marschhausen pointed out the many of the noon aide positions are being filled mostly by our bus drivers. We are pleased and proud to have our bus drivers serve in these positions.

F ACTION AGENDA

- F1 The Board of Education approved the 2020 Summer Graduate Joshua Wayne Walker, Hilliard Bradley High School.

The Board congratulates Joshua and wishes him the best for his future.

- F2 The Board of Education reduced the Band and Color Guard participation fee for the 2020-2021 school year to \$50. This is due to a decrease in opportunities for the students to perform, resulting in decreased costs for these programs.

Mr. Lambert asked if there are other extracurricular programs affected by this? Dr. Marschhausen answered that our athletic programs are still as active and have the same costs as they usually do.

G **REPORTS / INFORMATION / EXHIBIT ITEM**

G1 Committee Reports

Mr. Abate talked about the Facilities Committee meeting that was held on Friday, September 11, 2020. A few community members attended the meeting. One of the questions was about the Alton Darby/Darby Creek Campus – is the district moving forward on this merger? We are still planning to move forward with this. We will be working with the staff of both buildings. More communication will begin to happen regarding this soon.

Another question was how much money has the district spent related to COVID-19. Mr. McDonough explained the money we have received for these expenses. The first is the COVID-19 Relief Fund for \$812,000. We are required to spend these funds by the end of the year, December 31, 2020. We have spent almost \$700,000 on PPE, curriculum materials, and hygiene safety items. We have also received CARES funds of \$1.4 million. We have until September 2022 to spend these funds. We have spent approximately \$600,000 so far on cleaning supplies and curriculum materials for the Online Academy.

This past summer, the district spent \$3.1 million on summer paving projects, technology, field improvements, and the Britton/Norwich Campus. In 2021, we are planning for the following projects – Alton Darby/Darby Creek Campus, the Bradley HS field, and the Heritage MS parking lot.

Mrs. Long provided an update from the Ohio School Boards Association. Since the conference is going to be virtual this year, they have postponed our composting presentation. We may be able to share our program at a future conference.

G2 Enrollment

G3 Superintendent's Update

- 1) Planning September Work Session
 - a. Equity and Diversity Presentation – what we've done and what's next
 - b. Technology Update – the Journey Continues
- 2) Planning October Work Session
 - a. Finance Committee Meeting in mid-October – budget numbers and levy evaluation
 - b. Five-year Forecast Presentation

c. Redistricting conversation with enrollment analysis

Over the past few years, Mr. Lambert has been instrumental in putting together the work session topics to have a regular schedule when we talk about specific issues. This schedule has been interrupted by the pandemic.

October has always been the “money” month, so we plan to get back on track with these discussions. We will review the Finance Committee and the five-year forecast. Hopefully, we will have information from Governor DeWine on the next budget. We also need to revisit our conversation about a possible redistricting.

In September, Mrs. Chatman will give us an update on where we are with our Equity and Diversity Committee work. There has been a great deal of interest in the work we did to start the school year and the professional development provided to staff.

3) District Enrollment Numbers

- a. Homeschool numbers increased this fall
- b. Kindergarten parents “holding” students back a year
- c. Online Academy Enrollment – challenges and benefits

Our student enrollment decreased by 470 compared to our enrollment last year at this time. Our kindergarten number is 801, which is lower than a typical year. This could mean that next year’s kindergarten class could be much larger than usual. We also have an additional 155 home school students.

We have some Online Academy challenges that are not curriculum-related. We have many students who want to return to the traditional school setting. We also have some students who want to get into the Online Academy for various reasons. When parents signed up students for the Online Academy, they committed for the first semester. We are only allowing students with exceptional circumstances to move in or out of the Online Academy before the end of the first semester.

Our goal is to survey the existing Online Academy students and parents at the end of the first quarter (mid-October) to determine if they want to stay. Then we will survey the remaining students and parents to see if anyone wants to move into the Online Academy for the second semester.

Mr. Woodford and Mr. Maggied have done an exceptional job of getting our students registered for College Credit Plus. We have more students this year than we’ve ever had in this program. Many of our Online Academy students have chosen to register for college courses since we are not able to offer AP and honors courses. We have 285 freshmen taking Columbus State and Ohio State courses. Ten percent of Columbus State’s College Credit Plus numbers are Hilliard kids. This program is a huge benefit for students and families.

4) Legislative Update – what’s passed and what’s cooking

Governor DeWine signed HB 606, for which we are thankful. This bill gives us immunity from COVID-19 related lawsuits as long as we are not dangerous or reckless. Also, it is retroactive to March 2020.

I credit Senator Kunze for being one of the co-sponsors of SB 358. Unfortunately, it doesn't look like it will pass. This would have reduced testing requirements for our students. Betsy DeVos, US DOE, has stated there will not be any waivers on Federal mandates.

It looks like Cupp/Patterson (HB 305) is now back on the table. There are some hearings scheduled in the Hearings Finance Subcommittee.

5) Building Use in COVID

I know there are many concerns about outside groups using our buildings. I had a conversation with Alex Jones at Franklin County Public Health. Unless a group is in a "sector-specific meeting," we are still limited to groups of ten or less. With this in mind, we do not plan to have any outside groups in our buildings. As the owner of the building, we are responsible for making sure anyone using our facilities is following the rules. Sector-specific guidelines are available from the Ohio Department of Health.

Also, we have shifted a lot of our custodians to the day shift. So, there are buildings that will not have the necessary custodial coverage available for the supervision of a group and the extra cleaning required. I am recommending our Policy Committee to review the current costs and structure of building use.

6) Communications and Engagement Process

- a. Redirecting parent concerns to the building level – following practice and policy
- b. Stay "Mission Focused" on what's most important – our "Changeless Core."

Dr. Marschhausen stated that our Board members have been phenomenal with all of the communication during this crisis. Moving forward, we are planning to direct concerns and complaints as specified in Board policy. We need to allow teachers and principals to address parent concerns/complaints before escalating to the Superintendent and/or Board of Education. I want the community to understand that we are not "passing the buck." The solutions generally happen closest to where the child is being educated.

I know that things are changing quickly due to this crisis, but our core has not changed. We want to get as many students in school as safely as possible. We have said from the start that we will use local data, once we have local data, to make these decisions. Ready for tomorrow is changing to meet the current time.

H CATS Presentation/Discussion/Action

The CATS team is proposing that we look at the following three triggers (our district data) to help determine a change in our instructional mode:

If the % of students absent for illness (unspecified) is greater than 15%	AND	If the % of staff/teachers absent for illness (unspecified) is greater than 5%	AND	The rate of nurse visits for CLI/ILI per 1,000 is higher than 5
--	------------	---	------------	--

If Franklin County gets to Level IV (purple), students will be eLearning at home, and staff will be working at home. Level IV (purple) means our healthcare system is overwhelmed. The following chart shows our proposed plan using Hilliard-specific CATS data.

Ohio Public Health Alert System Level	HCS D COVID-19 Rate/100,000	HCS D Thresholds Reached	Recommended District Learning Mode
LEVEL III RED	100+	Yes	eLearning
		No	Hybrid
	<100	Yes	eLearning
		No	Hybrid
LEVEL II ORANGE	50+	Yes	eLearning
		No	Hybrid
	<50	Yes	Hybrid
		No	All-In
LEVEL I YELLOW	25+	Yes	Hybrid
		No	All-In
	<25	Yes	All-In
		No	All-In

The far left column is where we start. Each column to the right allows for higher specificity and greater use of local data. **For example**, Franklin County is currently at Level II (orange). HCS D’s case count is over 50 per 100,000. Next, have we hit the three triggers? No, we have not so, we are in Hybrid. (Depicted in the chart below/highlighted in blue.)

LEVEL II ORANGE	50+	Yes	eLearning
		No	Hybrid
	<50	Yes	Hybrid
		No	All-In

IF our case count drops below 50 per 100,000, while in orange **AND** we **DO NOT** hit the triggers, we could be All-In. (Depicted in the chart above/highlighted in green).

If we use the local CATS data with these three thresholds to make decisions, we won't necessarily need to change our instructional mode if/when the alert level changes for Franklin County. The positivity rate for Ohio State University would still affect Franklin County's alert level, but would not affect HCSD's instructional mode. As we continue to work with Ohio State and the CATS system, we have more and better data specific to HCSD. Beginning this Friday, we will have graphs on the district website charting these three thresholds. The scientists and health officials have determined the numbers on these thresholds.

We will have positive cases, and we will follow the Franklin County Public Health's recommendations for contact tracing and quarantine. Masks and social distancing works. Since Governor DeWine's mask order for Franklin County has been in place, there has been a steep decline in the number of positive cases. At this time, HCSD's case count is 112 per 100,000. Therefore, All-In is not possible, at least in the short-term.

There are similar-sized districts in Ohio that are All-In. When they get a positive case in their district, they end up quarantining approximately 80 students because three-foot social distancing is not enough. So, we need to get our community spread down before we go to All-In.

The Board tabled this proposal and will consider it at a later meeting.

I **EXECUTIVE SESSION / ADJOURNMENT**

- 11 The meeting adjourned at 8:31 p.m.